

RWANDA / JUDGMENT

# KAMATENESI\_v.\_KING\_Faycal\_Hospital\_Rwanda\_Ltd\_419491\_kn

RLR V.2-2019

## COURT

Supreme Court

## DECIDED

27 June 2018

## CASE / FILE NUMBER

RC00003/2018/SC

Source: amategeko.gov.rw · Research copy typeset by Esheria. Not court-issued or certified.

## KAMATENESI\_v.\_KING\_Faycal\_Hospital\_Rwanda\_Ltd\_419491\_kn

- Source: Amategeko
- Section: Decisions (Judgements)
- Date: 2018-06-27
- Case/document no.: RC00003/2018/SC
- Collection: Supreme Court

### Text

#### Page 1

KAMATENESI v. KING FAYCAL HOSPITAL RWANDA Ltd [Rwanda URUKIKO RW'IKIRENGA – RC00003/2018/SC (Mugenzi P.J., Karimunda na Muhumuza, J) 27 Kamena 2018] Amategeko agenga imiburanishirize y'ianza mbonezamubano – Impaka zavutse mu irangiza rubanza –Mu gihe uwatsinzwe urubanza adahakana ingano y'ubwishyu bwategetswe n'inkiko mu byemezo birangizwa ahubwo yemera ko ariho kandi ko nta wundi ugomba kwishyura ibyo yatsindiwe, biba bigaragaza ko nta mpaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza. Amategeko agenga imiburanishirize y'ianza mbonezamubano – Impaka zavutse mu irangiza rubanza – Iyo icyiswe impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza ari urujijo uwatsinzwe urubanza yateje cyangwa ashaka guheza uwatsinze urubanza mu gihirahiro avuga ko hazishyura undi udafite aho ahuriye n'urubanza rurangizwa, Urukiko rufite inshingano zo kugaragaza ko imyitwarire y'uwasinzwe urubanza yabereye intambamyi inzira zo kwishyura uwatsinze, rugategeka ko urubanza rurangizwa n'uwarutsinzwe nta yandi mananiza. Incamake y'ikibazo: Nyuma yaho urukiko rw'ikirenga ruciriye urubanza ku bujuzire bwa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd, aho ibyo bitaro byavugaga

ko mu rubanza rwaciwe n'Urukiko Rukuru rwemeje indishyi zahawe Kamatenesi n'Urukiko Rwisumbuye rwa Gasabo zo kuba ibyo bitaro bitaramwitayeho nkuko bikwiye bituma atakaza ibice by'umubiri ndetse n'umwana yari atwite yitaba Imana, ibyo bitaro bivuga ko niba hari amakosa yakozwe akwiye kuryozwa umuganga wari ku izamu, cyangwa bigafatwa nk'impanuka abagore nka we badakunze kugira ibise bahura nayo. Kamatenesi yatanze inzitizi y'iburabubasha bw'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga kuko King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd yatsinzwe mu Rukiko Rwisumbuye rwa Gasabo no mu Rukiko Rukuru ku mpamvu zimwe. Urukiko rw'Ikirenga nyuma yo gusuzuma iyo nzitizi rwanzuye ko ifite ishingiro, runamugenera igihembo cy'Avoka. Nyuma y'imikirize y'urwo rubanza, Kamatenesi Jovia yashatse ko rurangizwa, King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd imubwira ko atariyo yakwishyura. Bityo bituma atanga ikirego mu Rukiko rw'Ikirenga avuga yagiye kwishyura abura ubwishyu kuko King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd yamubwiye ko umutungo wayo wose waguzwe n'ikigo cyitwa Oshen Health Care Rwanda naho imyenda yayo yegurirwa Leta y'u Rwanda. Yongeraho ko bandikiye Oshen Health Care Rwanda bayisaba kwishyurwa nayo ibabwira ko itarangiza urubanza itabayemo umuburanyi. Kamatenesi yatanze ikirego mu rukiko rw'Ikirenga gishingiye ku mpaka zavutse mu irangizarubanza, mu kirego cye yanareze Oshen Health Care nayo itanga inzitizi yo kuvanwa mu rubanza kuko ivuga ko ntaho ihuriye n'urubanza rwateye impaka mu kururangiza ndetse isaba n'indishyi. Urukiko nyuma yo gusuzuma iyo nzitizi rwasanze King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd yaremeye mu rubanza rurangizwa ko iriho, kandi ko Oshen Health Care itabaye umuburanyi mu rubanza rurangizwa, hanyuma rutegeka ko Oshen Health Care ivanwe mu rubanza, rutegeka Kamatenesi kuyiha indishyi. King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd yatanze inzitizi y'iburabubasha bw'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga, ivuga ko nyuma yaho Kamatenesi atangiye ikirego hasohotse Itegeko No30/2018 ryo ku wa 02/06/2018 rigena ububasha bw'inkiko rigaragaza ko ikirego cya Kamatenesi Jovia kitari mu bubasha bwarwo. Urukiko rwasanze mu itegeko rishya ry'ububasha bw'inkiko, hateganyijwe ko

## Page 2

inkiko zisanzweho zikomeza ibyo zari zatangiye gukora, muri ibyo hakaba harimo no gukemura impaka zijyanye n'imanza zacye. Urukiko rwanzura ko inzitizi nta shingiro ifite. Uhagarariye King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd, avuga ko icyemezo cy'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga mu rubanza rurangizwa gisobanutse kuko gitegeka King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd kwishyura kandi bikaba bidashoboka ko gihinduka. Yongeraho ko ibitaro bitanze kwishyura kandi ko byamwandikiye bimumenyesha ko azishyurwa na Leta y'u Rwanda binyuze muri Minisiteri y'Imari kuko ariyo yabyishingiye, ariko asanga byarakozwe mu buryo butari bwo kuko hari kwandikirwa Leta y'u Rwanda, Kamatenesi Jovia we akabimenyeshwa. Incamake y'icyemezo: 1. Mu gihe uwatsinzwe urubanza adahakana ingano y'ubwishyu bwategetswe n'inkiko mu byemezo birangizwa ahubwo yemera ko ariho kandi ko nta wundi ugomba kwishyura ibyo yatsindiwe, biba bigaragaza ko nta mpaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza.

2. Iyo icyiswe impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza ari urujijo uwatsinzwe urubanza yateje cyangwa ashaka guheza uwatsinze urubanza mu gihirahiro avuga ko hazishyura undi udafite aho ahuriye n'urubanza rurangizwa, Urukiko rwafite inshingano zo kugaragaza ko imyitwarire y'uwasinzwe urubanza yabereye intambamyi inzira zo kwishyura uwatsinze, rugategeka ko

urubanza rurangizwa n'ubarutsinzwe nta yandi mananiza. Nta mpaka ziri mu irangiza ry'urubanza RCAA00019/2017/CS. Urubanza RCAA00019/2017/CS rugomba kurangizwa mu gihe cy'ukwezi kumwe. Amategeko yifashishijwe Itegeko No30/2018 ryo ku wa 02/06/2018 rigena ububasha bw'inkiko, ingingo ya 105. Itegeko No22/2018 ryo ku wa 29/04/2018 ryerekeye imiburanishirize y'imanza z'imbonezamubano, iz'ubucuruzi, iz'umurimo n'iz'ubutegets, ingingo ya 247. Nta manza zifashishijwe Urubanza I. IMITERERE Y'URUBANZA [1] Uru rubanza rukomoka ku rubanza RCAA00019/2017/SC rwaciwe n'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga ku wa 16/02/2018 ku bujurire bwa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd. Muri urwo rubanza, King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yavugaga ko mu rubanza RCA00056-00057/2016/HC/KIG rwaciwe n'Urukiko Rukuru ku wa 21/04/2017 ku bujurire bw'urubanza rwari rwaciwe n'Urukiko Rwisumbuye rwa Gasabo, ibitaro byaciwe indishyi zo kuba zitaritaye uko bikwiye kuri Kamatenesi Jovia wahivurije akahatakariza ibice bimwe by'umubiri ndetse n'umwana yari atwite agapfa, nyamara habaye hari amakosa yakozwe akwiye kuryozwa Dr Rwibasira Muganda John wari ku izamu, cyangwa bigafatwa nk'impanuka abagore nka we, badakunze kugira ibise, bahura nayo. King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yavugaga kandi

### Page 3

ko yaciwe indishyi hashingiwe ku buhamya buvuguruzanya bwa Dr Rwibasira Muganda John ndetse hatitawe no ku mahirwe Kamatenesi Jovia afite yo kuzongera kubyara. [2] Muri urwo rubanza habanje gusuzumwa inzitizi yazamuwe na Kamatenesi Jovia, wavugaga ko ubujurire bwa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd butari mu bubasha bw'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga kuko yatsinzwe mu Rukiko Rwisumbuye rwa Gasabo no mu Rukiko Rukuru ku mpamvu zimwe. Mu rubanza rubanziriza urundi rwaciwe ku wa 16/02/2018, Urukiko rw'Ikirenga rwasanze inzitizi y'iburabubasha yatanze na Kamatenesi Jovia ifite ishingiro, rwanzura ko ubujurire bwa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd butari mu bubasha bwarwo, itegekwa guha Kamatenesi Jovia 500.000Frw y'igihembo cya Avoka, no guha Dr Rwibasira Muganda John 300.000Frw y'ikurikiranarubanza na 500.000Frw y'igihembo cya Avoka. [3] Kamatenesi Jovia avuga ko nyuma y'iki cyemezo yashatse kurangiza urubanza, King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd ibwira Umuhesha w'Inkiko w'umwuga ko yagurishijwe Oshen Health Care ku wa 25/04/2017, imyenda yayo yose yegurirwa Leta y'u Rwanda, naho Oshen Health Care imubwira ko ntaho ihuriye n'urubanza rurangizwa kandi ko ishinze gusa imicungire ya King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd, asaba ko uru Rukiko rukemura izo mpaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza kugira ngo abone ibyo yatsindiye. [4] Iburanisha mu ruhame ryashyizwe ku wa 19/06/2018, icyakora uwo munsu ntirwaburanishwa kuko Oshen Health Care yavuze ko itabonye umwana wo gusubiza imyanzuro y'uruhande rurega, urubanza rwimurirwa ku wa 25/06/2018 kugira ngo ababuranyi bategure kandi bahererekanye imyanzuro ku nzitizi batanze no ku kirego cy'iremezo. [5] Kuri uwo munsu, Urukiko rwabanye gusuzuma inzitizi yazamuwe na Oshen Health Care yavugaga ko ntaho ihuriye n'urubanza rurangizwa, ikaba itumva impamvu Kamatenesi Jovia yayireze, isaba uru Rukiko kuyivana mu rubanza no kumutegeka kuyiha 1.000.000Frw y'igihembo cya Avoka kuko yashowe mu rubanza rutayireba, yiyambaza avoka ubihemberwa. [6] Nyuma yo kumva ibisobanuro by'ababuranyi bose kuri iyo nzitizi, Urukiko rwariherereye, rusanga King Faycal Hospital Rwanda

Ltd yaburanye urubanza rurangizwa yivugira ko iriho, rusanga kandi Oshen Health Care itarabaye umuburanyi mu rubanza rurangizwa ari narwo rwabyaye impaka, rwanzura ko nta mpamvu y'uko yatagekwa kurangirizwaho urubanza itaburanye kandi uwaruburanye ahari, rutegeka ko ivanwe mu rubanza, Kamatenesi Jovia ategakwa kuyiha 500.000Frw y'igihembo cya Avoka kuko yayishoye mu rubanza rutayireba. [7] King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yatanze inzitizi y'iburabubasha bw'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga, ivuga ko nyuma yaho Kamatenesi Jovia atangiye ikirego (ku wa 17/05/2018), hasohotse Itegeko No30/2018 ryo ku wa 02/06/2018 rigena ububasha bw'inkiko rigaragaza ko ikirego cya Kamatenesi Jovia kitari mu bubasha bwarwo. Ivuga kandi ko isesengura ry'Itegeko No22/2018 ryo ku wa 29/04/2018 ryerekeye imiburanishirize y'imanza z'imbonezamubano, iz'ubucuruzi, iz'umurimo n'iz'ubutegetsi ryumvikanisha ko impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza zitagikemurirwa mu nkiko, ariko uru Rukiko rubibonye ukundi, rwakwemeza ko kuva aya mategeko mashya yasohoka, Kamatenesi Jovia yagombaga kuregera Urukiko Rwisumbuye kuko arirwo rufite ububasha bwo gukemura ibibazo bitari mu bubasha bw'izindi nkiko, cyangwa se akaba yararegeye Urukiko Rukuru kuko arirwo rwaciye, ku rwego rwa

#### Page 4

nyuma, urubanza rurangizwa bitewe n'uko Urukiko rw'Ikirenga rwagarukiye gusa ku nzitizi y'iburabubasha. [8] Nyuma yo kumva ibisobanuro byatanzwe n'ababuranyi bombi kuri iyi nzitizi, Urukiko rwariherereye, rusanga ikirego cya Kamatenesi Jovia ari igisaba gukemura impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza rwaciye ku rwego rwa nyuma n'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga, ndetse hari n'ibyo uru Rukiko rwemeje King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd itarangije nk'uko ibisabwa n'amategeko, rusanga kandi ingingo ya 105 y'Itegeko No30/2018 ryo ku wa 02/06/2018 rigena ububasha bw'inkiko isaba ko mu gihe hagitegerejwe ko inkiko nshya zitangira imirimo yazo, izari zisanzweho zikomeza ibyo zari zaratangiye gukora, muri ibyo hakaba harimo no gukemura impaka zijyanye n'imanza zacye kuko izi manza ku mpaka zavutse mu irangizarubanza ziba zigamije gutanga umucyo ku byemejwe n'Urukiko. Urukiko rwanzuye ko ntaho rwahera rwemeza ko ikirego cya Kamatenesi Jovia cyari kwoherezwa mu Rukiko Rwisumbuye cyangwa mu Rukiko Rukuru mu gihe agifite amahirwe yo kuburanira imbere y'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga, kandi ayo mahirwe akaba atayavutswa n'uko ibyo yaburaniye byaba noneho biri mu bubasha bw'urundi Rukiko, rufatira icyemezo mu ntebe ko ikirego cye kiri mu bubasha bwarwo, rutegeka ko iburanisha rikomeza. [9] Urubanza rwaburanishijwe mu ruhame, Kamatenesi Jovia aburanirwa na Me Mwine Geoffrey naho King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd iburanirwa na Me Kayirangwa Claire. II. IKIBAZO KIGIZE URUBANZA N'ISESENGURWA RYACYO a Kumenya niba hari impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza RCAA00019/2017/SC rwaciye n'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga ku wa 16/02/2018. [10] Me Mwine Geoffrey, uburanira Kamatenesi Jovia, avuga ko Umuhesha w'Inkiko yagiye kwishyuriza Kamatenesi Jovia abura ubwishyu kuko King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yamubwiye ko umutungo wayo wose waguzwe n'ikigo cyitwa OSHEN HEALTH CARE RWANDA naho imyenda yayo yegurirwa Leta y'u Rwanda. Asobanura ko bandikiye Oshen Health Care Rwanda bayisaba kwishyurwa nayo ibabwira ko itarangiza urubanza itabayemo umuburanyi. Avuga ko mu gihe King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yaba noneho yemera kwishyura, yababwira

igihe ntarengwa yaba irangije kwishyuramo kuko Kamatenesi Jovia atajya kwishyura Leta y'u Rwanda cyangwa Oshen Health Care Rwanda ataribo batsinzwe urubanza. [11] Me Kayirangwa Claire, uburanira King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd, avuga ko icyemezo cy'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga mu rubanza rurangizwa gisobanutse kuko gitegeka King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd kwishyura kandi bikaba bidashoboka ko gihinduka. Asobanura ko ibitaro bitanze kwishyura kandi ko byandikiye Kamatenesi Jovia bimumenyesha ko azishyurwa na Leta y'u Rwanda binyuze muri Minisiteri y'Imari kuko ariyo yabyishingiye, icyakora ko nawe asanga byarakozwe mu buryo butari bwo kuko hari kwandikirwa Leta y'u Rwanda (Minisiteri y'Imari), Kamatenesi Jovia akabimenyeshwa. Avuga ko King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd itakwohereza Kamatenesi Jovia ngo ajye kwishyuriza muri Leta y'u Rwanda (Minisiteri y'Imari) cyangwa muri Oshen Health Care kuko ataribo batsinzwe urubanza, akaba asanga noneho ibitaro bigiye guhita byandikira Minisiteri y'Imari, Kamatenesi Jovia akabimenyeshwa. Avuga kandi ko iby'uko uregwa yahabwa igihe ntarengwa cyo kwishyura

## Page 5

bitahabwa ishingiro kuko byaba bivuze ko Urukiko rufashe icyemezo ku irangiza ry'urubanza kandi ataribwo rwaregwe. UKO URUKIKO RUBIBONA [12] Ingingo ya 247, igika cya mbere, y'Itegeko No22/2018 ryo ku wa 29/04/2018 ryerekeye imiburanishirize y'imanza z'imbonezamubano, iz'ubucuruza, iz'umurimo n'iz'ubutegetsu iteganya ko "mu gihe cy'iminsi mirongo itatu (30) kuva urubanza rubaye itegeko [...] uwatsinzwe yegera uwamutsinze amumenyesha uburyo yifuza gushyira mu bikorwa ibyo icyo cyemezo cy'urukiko [...] gitegeka kugira ngo babyumvikaneho." [13] Dosiye y'urubanza irimo inyandiko Me Mwine Geoffrey yandikiye Umuyobozi wa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd ku wa 27/03/2018, amumenyesha ko ibyo bitaro byatsinzwe urubanza byaburanaga na Kamatenesi Jovia, bitegekwa kwishyura 31.100.000Frw, amusaba kuyishyura ku bwumvikane mu gihe cy'iminsi irindwi. Ku wa 18/04/2018, Umuyobozi Mukuru wa King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yasubije Me Mwine Geofrey ko ibyo bitaro biriho ku izina gusa kuko byeguriwe Oshen Health Care n'umwishingize wayo Oshen Group S.A. kandi ko kuva ku wa 25/04/2016, imyenda yose ikomoka ku bikorwa by'ibitaro yishingiye na Leta y'u Rwanda, amusaba kuzaganira na Leta y'u Rwanda, bakumvikana uburyo bazishyurwa. [14] Dosiye y'urubanza irimo na none urwandiko Oshen Health Care yandikiye Me Mukeshimana Juliette, Umuhesha w'Inkiko, wagiye kurangiza urubanza, ko atariyo yakwishyuzwa ibyaryojwe King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd kuko ntaho ihuriye n'imanza yatsinzwe, kandi ko ibyo bitaro biriho mu buryo bwemewe n'amategeko, bifite n'Umuyobozi Mukuru ushinze gucunga uko bikwiye ibikorwa byayo bya mbere y'amasezerano yo ku wa 25/04/2016 bagiranye na Leta y'u Rwanda (King Faysal Hospital is still legally existent with an appointed Chief Executive Officer whose mandate is to ensure a proper management of any outstanding business of the hospital at the date of takeover by Oshen Health Care Rwanda and this is clearly explained in the Concession agreement signed between the Government of Rwanda herein represented by MINECOFIN and Oshen Health Care Rwanda). [15] Urukiko rurasanga King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd idahakana ingano y'ubwishyu bwategetswe n'inkiko mu byemezo birangizwa, yivugira ko ikiriho kandi yemera ko nta wundi, yaba Leta y'u Rwanda

cyangwa Oshen Health Care Rwanda, ukwiye kubazwa iby'irangizwa ry'imanza yatsinzwe kuko ariyo ubwayo yategetswe kwishyura, ibi kandi byongeye gushimangirwa n'urwandiko Oshen Health Care Rwanda yandikiye Kamatenesi Jovia ivuga ko ibyo bitaro bikiriho ndetse byahawe n'Umuyobozi Mukuru ushinze gukema ibibazo byaba byarasigaye nyuma y'amasezerano Oshen Health Care Rwanda yagiranye na Leta y'u Rwanda, byose byumvikanisha ko mu gihe uwatsinzwe urubanza yemera ko ari we ugomba kwishyura ibyo yategetswe n'inkiko, bigaragaza ko nta mpaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza. [16] Urukiko rurasanga ikiswe impaka zavutse mu irangiza ry'urubanza, ari urujijo King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yateye Kamatenesi Jovia ikamuheza mu gihirahiro aho kwubahiriza ibyo yari yategetswe n'inkiko, ibitaro bikaba kandi byaremereye imbere y'uru Rukiko ko uburyo byitwaye mu kibazo cya Kamatenesi Jovia atari bwo, kuko aho kumwishyuriza ku mwishingizi wabyo (Leta y'u Rwanda) umwenda byemera ko ari uwabyo, byamusabye kugirana ibiganiro na Leta y'u Rwanda kandi bizi neza ko nta kimuhuza nayo, ibi byose bibikora byirengagije ko

## Page 6

kubw'Itegeko byagombaga kwibwiriza, bikagaragariza Kamatenesi Jovia uburyo bizishyura umwenda yatsindiye mu manza. [17] Urukiko rurasanga na none King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yarakomeje guseta ibirenge mu kubahiriza ibyemezo by'inkiko, aho gukora ibikwiye byari gutuma Kamatenesi Jovia yishyurwa ibyo yatsindiye, imyitwarire yabyo ibera intambamyi inzira zo kwishyurwa kuko yari izi neza ko Kamatensi Jovia atari kuja mu mishyikirano yo kwishyurwa na Leta y'u Rwanda kandi ntakimuhuza nayo, ariyo mpamvu, hashingiwe ku biteganywa n'ingingo ya 247, igika cya mbere, y'Itegeko No22/2018 ryo ku wa 29/04/2018 ryerekeye imiburanishirize y'imanza z'imbonezamubano, iz'ubucuruzi, iz'umurimo n'iz'ubutegetsi, King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd ikwiye guhabwa igihe kitarenze ukwezi kumwe kugira ngo ibe irangije kwishyura ibyo yategetswe n'inkiko mu manza yaburanaga na Kamatenesi Jovia.

- b. Kumenya niba indishyi zisabwa zifite ishingiro [18] Me Kayirangwa Claire, uburanira King FaycaL Hospital Rwanda Ltd, avuga ko uru Rukiko rusanze ikirego cya Kamatenesi Jovia nta shingiro gifite nk'uko abibona, rwamutegeka gutanga 1.000.000Frw y'igihembo cya Avoka. [19] Me Mwine Geoffrey, uburanira Kamatenesi Jovia, avuga ko nta yindi nzira uyu yari asigaranye kugira ngo yishyurwe uretse iyo kugana Inkiko, ko asanga King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd ariyo nyirabayazana w'uru rubanza, ariyo mpamvu idakwiye guhabwa amafaranga y'igihembo cya Avoka isaba, ahubwo ko ikwiye gutegekwa kwishyura Kamatenesi Jovia 1.000.000Frw akubiyemo amafaranga y'ikurikiranarubanza n'igihembo cya Avoka. UKO URUKIKO RUBIBONA [20] Urukiko rurasanga nk'uko byasobanuwe haruguru, Kamatenesi Jovia yarongeye kugana inzira y'inkiko biturutse ku kuba King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd yaramusize mu gihirahiro, yiyambaza inkiko agirango zimurenganure, byumvikanisha ko iyo ibitaro byubahiriza ibyo byategetswe n'Urukiko nta rujijo biteye cyangwa bigasobanurira Kamatenesi Jovia uburyo bizamwishyura, bitari kuba ngombwa ko yongerera kugana inkiko ariyo mpamvu amafaranga y'igihembo cya Avoka King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd isaba itayakwiriye. [21] Urukiko rurasanga amafaranga y'ikurikiranarubanza n'igihembo cya Avoka Kamatenesi Jovia asaba ayakwiriye, ariko kuko

atagaragaza ko 1.000.000Frw ari yo yatanze kuri uru rubanza, akaba agenewe 800.000Frw akubiyemo ay'ikurikiranarubanza n'igihembo cya Avoka. III. ICYEMEZO CY'URUKIKO [22] Rwemeje ko nta mpaka ziri mu irangiza ry'urubanza RCAA00019/2017/CS rwaciwe n'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga ku wa 16/02/2018; [23] Rutegetse King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd kurangiza urubanza RCAA00019/2017/CS rwaciwe n'Urukiko rw'Ikirenga ku wa 16/02/2018 mu gihe cy'ukwezi kumwe guhera igihe uru rubanza rusomewe;

## Page 7

[24] Rutegetse King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd guha Kamatenesi Jovia 800.000Frw akubiyemo ay'ikurikiranarubanza n'igihembo cya Avoka; [25] Rutegetse King Faycal Hospital Rwanda Ltd gutanga amagarama y'urubanza.

## Source & reproduction note

Judgment wording, source notices and original paragraph numbers are retained. Esheria supplies the layout and this PDF's page numbers; these are not the source pagination. This is a research copy, not an official or certified court document. Check quotations, citations and publication restrictions against the original source before relying on it.

ORIGINAL SOURCE <https://www.amategeko.gov.rw/view/doc/6344/6627>

CASE PAGE <https://chat.esheria.ai/case-law/rwanda/kamatenesi-jovia-v-king-faycal-hospital-rwanda-ltd-judgmentenforcement-supreme-court-2018>

Prepared on 14 October 2026 · Esheria