

SOUTH AFRICA / JUDGMENT

Yengwa and Another v S (SS104/2008)

[2010] ZAWCHC 415 (3 June 2010)

[2010] ZAWCHC 415**COURT**

Western Cape High Court, Cape Town

BEFORE

Moosa

CASE / FILE NUMBER

SS104/2008

Source: saflii.org · Research copy typeset by Esheria. Not court-issued or certified.

Source record**IN****THE HIGH COURT OF SOUTH AFRICA****(WESTERN****CAPE HIGH COURT, CAPE TOWN)****CASE****NUMBER:**

SS104/2008

DATE:

3

JUNE 2010

In

the matter between:

NKOSINATHI

YENGWA

.....1st

Applicant

MBULELO

MWANDA

.....2nd

Applicantand

THE

STATE

.....Respondent

JUDGMENT

Application for Leave to Appeal

MOOSA, J

This is an application by Mr Nkosinathi Yengwa and Mr Mbulelo Mwanda for leave to appeal against their conviction. Insofar as Mr Mwanda is concerned, he also applies for leave to appeal in respect of his sentence. Counsel for both the applicants set out quite

comprehensively the grounds of appeal in their notice of application for leave to appeal and the Court is not going to repeat them.

The Court now has to decide whether another court could come to a different conclusion to that to which this Court had come, both in respect of the convictions and insofar as Mr Mwanda is concerned, in respect of his sentence. It is so that in the case of Mr Mwanda, the Court found, in respect of sentence, that there were no substantial and compelling circumstances to depart from the prescribed minimum sentences in respect of the murder and robbery charges. In respect of Mr Yengwa, the Court did come to the conclusion that there were substantial and compelling circumstances to depart from the prescribed minimum sentences in respect of the murder and robbery charges.

The Court heard argument both by counsel for Mr Yengwa and Mr Mwanda in respect of both the conviction and in respect of the sentences

insofar as Mr Mwanda is concerned. It is so that the conviction is based firstly, on circumstantial evidence; secondly, on the question of identification; thirdly, on the question of an alleged confession and the pointing out and lastly, on certain forensic evidence. Cumulatively, the Court came to the conclusion that the State had proved its case beyond reasonable doubt that the accused committed the offences in respect of which they were found guilty, and accordingly convicted them on those charges

In view of the evidence tendered by the State and in view of the nature of such evidence, and the fact that the Court convicted them on the basis of circumstantial evidence, this Court is satisfied that another court might come to a different

conclusion

than the one that this Court came to in convicting the accused. Consequently, insofar as the convictions are concerned in respect of both the applicants, the Court is satisfied that there are reasonable prospects of success on appeal. Insofar as the sentence of Mr Mwanda is concerned, the Court found that there were no substantial and compelling circumstances to depart from the prescribed minimum sentences in respect of the murder and robbery charges. This Court is also satisfied that another court might come to a different conclusion than the one this Court had come to in respect of whether there were substantial and compelling circumstances in respect of

the murder and the robbery charges as far as Mr Mwanda is concerned. In the circumstances the Court also concludes that there are reasonable prospects of success insofar as the sentence is concerned in respect of Mwanda. The Court accordingly grant him also leave to appeal in respect of the sentence. In the circumstances, the Court then grants both Mr Yengwa and Mr Mwanda leave to appeal to the full bench of this court in respect of the convictions and insofar as Mr Mwanda is concerned, the Court also grants him leave to appeal in respect of the sentence to the full bench of this division. MOOSA, J

In view of the evidence tendered by the State and in view of the nature of such evidence, and the fact that the Court convicted them on the basis of circumstantial evidence, this Court is satisfied that another court might come to a different

conclusion

than the one that this Court came to in convicted the accused. Consequently, insofar as the convictions are concerned in respect of both the applicants, the Court is satisfied that there are reasonable prospects of success on appeal.

Insofar as the sentence of Mr Mwanda is concerned, the Court found that there were no substantial and compelling circumstances to depart from the prescribed minimum sentences in respect of the murder and robbery charges. This Court is also satisfied that another court might come to a different conclusion than the one this Court had come to in respect of whether there were substantial and compelling circumstances in respect of the murder and the robbery charges as far as Mr Mwanda is concerned. In the circumstances the Court also concludes that there are reasonable prospects of success insofar as the sentence is concerned in respect of Mwanda. The Court accordingly grant him also leave to appeal in respect of the sentence. In the circumstances, the Court then grants both Mr Yengwa and Mr Mwanda leave to appeal to the full bench of this court in respect of the convictions and insofar as Mr Mwanda is concerned, the Court also grants him leave to appeal in respect of the sentence to the full bench of this division.

MOOSA, J

Source & reproduction note

Judgment wording, source notices and original paragraph numbers are retained. Esheria supplies the layout and this PDF's page numbers; these are not the source pagination. This is a research copy, not an official or certified court document. Check quotations, citations and publication restrictions against the original source before relying on it.

ORIGINAL SOURCE <https://www.saflii.org/za/cases/ZAWCHC/2010/415.html>

CASE PAGE <https://chat.esheria.ai/case-law/south-africa/yengwa-and-another-v-s-unknown-topic-awchc-2010>

Prepared on 11 October 2026 · Esheria